

Saturn sighted for Eid instead of moon

Post Reply Post Reply

Author Message Topic Rating Rate Topic Topic Search Topic Search Topic Options
Topic Options

wasi siddiqui View Drop Down

Senior Member

Senior Member

Avatar

Joined: 22 April 2005

Location: Angola

Status: Offline

Points: 327 Post Options Post Options

Thanks (0) Thanks(0) Quote wasi siddiqui Quote Post ReplyReplyDirect Link To This
Post Topic: Saturn sighted for Eid instead of moon

Posted: 06 September 2011 at 9:51am

Assalamo Alaikum,

This is a neutral analysis of the issue of moon sighting on August 29, 2011 in Saudi Arabia by the Daily Guardian, UK. More and more scientists (including Saudi Scientists) and scholars of Islam are raising questions on the legitimacy of Eid ul Fitr on August 30, 2011.

May Allah safeguard our EEMAAN. Ameen.

Thanks

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2011/sep/05/astronomers-query-ramadan-end>

Saturnine faces as astronomers query moon sighting over Saudi Arabia

Error could mean millions of Muslims began Eid celebrations on the wrong day

Siraj Datoo

guardian.co.uk, Monday 5 September 2011 19.33 BST

Article history

Astronomers say Saudi clerics announced the end of Ramadan too early after mistaking Saturn for the moon. Photograph: Ho/AFP/Getty Images

It is a pivotal point in the Islamic calendar, the moment when a month of fasting and contemplation finally comes to an end. But the celebration of Eid this year has been marred by controversy after claims that Saudi religious officials announced the festival on the wrong day.

Traditionally Ramadan comes to an end when the new moon is visible with the naked eye.

This year, officials in Saudi Arabia announced a sighting on Monday 29 August. Since then, however, astronomers have presented evidence to show that the moon was not visible at the time, and suggested that the Saudi officials may have actually been looking at Saturn.

Maged Abou Zahra, president of the Jeddah Astronomical Society, told the Egyptian paper al-Shorouk: "The sighting of a new moon would have simply been impossible."

If true, the mistake would mean that millions of Muslims around the world stopped fasting a day too early. When the new moon rises, it is not visible as it is completely in the shadow of the earth and astronomers claim that it usually takes around 15 hours before it is visible to the naked eye.

But in Saudi Arabia barely five hours passed before authorities announced the first "moonsighting" had been made by the requisite credible and pious person.

Middle Eastern analyst Issandr El Amrani, author of the Arabist blog, said the confusion suggested that Muslims should start using more scientific methods to determine the start of the Islamic month.

"The need for a naked eye sighting is a literal interpretation of Islamic tradition that should be adapted to technological realities," he said.

Many claim that the Saudis, in fact, already use astronomical calculations to pinpoint the start of the next Islamic month, but present the information as a traditional moonsighting to please conservative Muslims. There has been no official comment from Saudi religious authorities.

The confusion has prompted some commentators to question whether the world's estimated 1.6 billion Muslims should follow rulings from Saudi clerics simply because the site of the holy pilgrimage, the Ka'aba, is located in the country.

Sheikh bin Baz, a religious scholar in Mecca said in a recent speech that "there are no

grounds for Muslims in the UK to follow Saudi Arabia".

Iqbal Sacranie, former general secretary of the Muslim Council of Britain, said that he wanted to unite the Muslim community to celebrate the occasion at the same time: "It is extremely sad that the Muslim community in the UK are divided on this very important issue of celebrating Eid. I believe it is now time for key scholars from different schools of thought to come together with Muslim organisations like the MCB and address this issue once and for all."

Ahmed Versi, editor of the Muslim News said that it was not uncommon for Muslim communities to celebrate Eid on different dates ♦ mosques in the UK marked the festival on at least three different days.

Websites such as Moonsighting.com have existed for a number of years, giving the precise details of where it is possible for the moon to be seen.

But the majority of Muslims still use more traditional methods, only celebrating Eid when the moon is seen with the naked eye. This year's embarrassing error may lead more people to use astronomical calculations to decide about the new Islamic month instead of relying on the Saudi methodology.

<http://dailytimes.com.ng/article/saudi-government-announce-iedalfitr-31august>

Saudi government to pay fine for getting Sallah date wrong

Authority is expected to pay the sum of 1 Billion riyals for this mistake.

Article | September 5, 2011 - 1:45am | By From the wires

The Saudi government has admitted that there's been a mistake about the correct day of Eid el Fitr this year (2011).

This occurred due to a misunderstanding of a particular phenomenon caused by the planet Saturn when its path crosses that of the planet Mercury. This happened a few years ago as well. when what it thought to be Hilal (new moon) was actually not.

The Government gave order the to the people and citizens of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia to quit fasting a day earlier than it should have, in other words, Eid el-Fitr was supposed to be on August 31, and not on August 30.

The Saudi Government will pay 1 Billion riyals (known as Kafarah) for this mistake

Back to Top

Sponsored Links

Back to Top

Ron Webb View Drop Down

Senior Member

Senior Member

Avatar

Male atheist

Joined: 30 January 2008

Location: Ottawa, Canada

Status: Offline

Points: 2493 Post Options Post Options

Thanks (0) Thanks(0) Quote Ron Webb Quote Post ReplyReplyDirect Link To This Post
Posted: 06 September 2011 at 4:50pm

I'm no astronomer, but I've seen Saturn and I've seen a crescent moon, and I don't see how anyone could mistake one for the other. It sounds to me like the Saudi clerics are already relying on astronomical data, but they just didn't realise that the new moon isn't visible a mere five hours after conjunction (alignment with the sun).

Addeenul ♦Aql ♦ Religion is intellect.

Back to Top

Sign*Reader View Drop Down

Senior Member

Senior Member

Avatar

Joined: 02 November 2005

Status: Offline

Points: 3352 Post Options Post Options

Thanks (0) Thanks(0) Quote Sign*Reader Quote Post ReplyReplyDirect Link To This Post
Posted: 06 September 2011 at 9:58pm

I think if at all possible these clerics' credentials need be yanked...if they can't differentiate between Saturn and crescent they need to get their head examined. The heat has fried their brains if there were any. Period...

Saudis gov paying kaffara is a joke...

This what you get by easy money!

Edited by Sign*Reader - 06 September 2011 at 9:59pm

Kismet Domino:

Faith/Courage/Liberty/Abundance/Selfishness/Immorality/Apathy/Bondage or extinction.

[Back to Top](#)

[abuayisha View Drop Down](#)

Senior Member

Senior Member

Avatar

Joined: 05 October 1999

Status: Offline

Points: 5046 [Post Options](#) [Post Options](#)

[Thanks \(0\)](#) [Thanks\(0\)](#) [Quote abuayisha](#) [Quote](#) [Post Reply](#)[ReplyDirect](#) [Link To This Post](#)
Posted: 06 September 2011 at 10:30pm

Astronomer threatened with lawsuit for doubting Eid moon sighting

By MD HUMAIDAN | ARAB NEWS

Published: Sep 3, 2011 23:40 Updated: Sep 3, 2011 23:40

JEDDAH: A number of conservative scholars have threatened to sue Saudi astronomer and scientist Khaled Al-Zaaq for doubting the testimony of citizens who reported to the Hilal panel (moon sighting committee) that the Shawwal crescent was visible on Ramadan 29 (Aug. 29).

After confirming the veracity of the sighting by the people who had reported to the panel, the committee declared the end to the fasting month of Ramadan and signaled the advent of Eid Al-Fitr the next day (Tuesday).

The threats of action came amidst an ongoing debate between Muslim scholars and astronomers about the possibility and probability of sighting the moon on Aug. 29. The astronomers claim the moon could not be sighted on that day as it had eclipsed before sunset.

According to the Islamic calendar, the Arabic months can be either 29 or 30 days long. On many occasions, Eid has been celebrated after only 29 days of fasting.

But this year the debate turned heated after Al-Zaaq was widely quoted by local press and electronic sites that there was no way to sight the crescent on the night of Ramadan 29, thus casting doubts on the testimony of those who claimed to have seen it.

The purists said the astronomer should not have cast doubts on the testimonies of the people who sighted the moon because their antecedents are checked before their word is accepted. Those who call in after sighting the moon are known for their integrity and straightforwardness.

A number of Saudi astronomers had issued press statements claiming that the moon could not be sighted while renowned Islamic scholars defended the testimonies of the people who sighted the moon and said Eid came at the right time.

Grand Mufti Sheikh Abdul Aziz bin Abdullah Al-Asheikh in his Friday sermon at Imam Turki bin Abdullah Mosque in Riyadh described those who doubted the moon sighting as "motivated and deviated people with foul mouths."

"There are unjust pens and foul tongues that cast doubt on our religion which should be silenced. We are strictly following the Sunnah of our Prophet in fasting and marking Eid days," he said, accusing the doubting astronomers of trying to impose their opinions on the nation.

The mufti said the Shariah was clear in the procedures of moon sighting and added that Muslims would never give up the Sunnah for false opinions.

The moon was very clear the next day and was seen in various areas on Tuesday night. This supported the stand of those who said they had sighted the moon on Monday evening.

A number of citizens in the western Al-Ais area said they were able to sight the moon on the night of Monday for half an hour. Their testimony contradicts the claims of the astronomers who said that the moon could not be sighted.

🔍 2010 Arab News

[Back to Top](#)

[Sawtul Khilafah View Drop Down](#)

Senior Member

Senior Member

Avatar

Joined: 20 July 2006

Location: Peru

Status: Offline

Points: 623

[Post Options](#) [Post Options](#)

Thanks (0) [Thanks\(0\)](#) [Quote Sawtul Khilafah](#) [Quote](#) [Post Reply](#) [ReplyDirect](#) [Link To This Post](#) Posted: 23 September 2011 at 5:07am

well this doesn't concern anyone who fasted for 30 days since you celebrate Eid anyway after 30 days. I fasted for 30 days myself so whether or not the Moon was really visible I had to celebrate Eid. This is how the Prophet (saw) taught us to fast, 29 or 30 days so if 30 days are over you know you must celebrate Eid

[Back to Top](#)

[Sign*Reader View Drop Down](#)

Senior Member

Senior Member

Avatar

Joined: 02 November 2005

Status: Offline

Points: 3352 Post Options Post Options

Thanks (0) Thanks(0) Quote Sign*Reader Quote Post ReplyReplyDirect Link To This Post
Posted: 24 September 2011 at 5:32pm

Hey Bro X

salaam

Long time no see, where have you been?

Hope all is well...

Kismet Domino:

Faith/Courage/Liberty/Abundance/Selfishness/Immorality/Apathy/Bondage or extinction.

Back to Top

Sawtul Khilafah View Drop Down

Senior Member

Senior Member

Avatar

Joined: 20 July 2006

Location: Peru

Status: Offline

Points: 623 Post Options Post Options

Thanks (0) Thanks(0) Quote Sawtul Khilafah Quote Post ReplyReplyDirect Link To This Post
Posted: 27 September 2011 at 10:00am

Originally posted by Sign*Reader Sign*Reader wrote:

Hey Bro X salaam Long time no see, where have you been?Hope all is well...

wa alaykomossalam wr wb

alhamdolellah Im fine, I've been making videos instead of just typing stuff, get more viewers that way. I posted some of my videos before, here's my account:

<http://www.youtube.com/user/Zakah1?feature=mhee>

and all those fools who used to accuse me of not really being Iranian can see clips of me in Iran and even videos of me speaking Farsi/Persian

Edited by Sawtul Khilafah - 27 September 2011 at 10:00am

Back to Top

honeto View Drop Down

Senior Member

Senior Member

Avatar

Male Islam

Joined: 20 March 2008

Location: Texas

Status: Offline

Points: 2493 Post Options Post Options

Thanks (0) Thanks(0) Quote honeto Quote Post ReplyReplyDirect Link To This Post
Posted: 08 November 2011 at 3:21pm

Salam,

I remember the full moon after Eid-ul-Fitr was a confirmation for me that we ate up one fast.

Hasan

The friends of God will certainly have nothing to fear, nor will they be grieved. Al Quran 10:62